INVESTIGATING PROFESSIONAL ROLE IDENTITIES OF EFL PRE-SERVICE TEACHER THROUGH PHOTOVOICE BASED SELF REFLECTION IN TEACHING PRACTICUM

Devi Novitasari[1]
Abd Rahman[2]

Universitas 17 Agustus 1945 Banyuwangi
[12] devi_novitasari87@yahoo.com
abd.rahman_bwi@yahoo.com

Abstract

Much research has confirmed the important role of reflection to promote pre-service teachers' professional role identity in their teaching practices. A myriad of reflection tools has been used to promote teachers' professional identity including journal writing, video journaling, portfolio, group discussions, and online discussion. However, using photo voice as a tool for reflection to promote EFL pre-service teachers' professional role identity in teaching practicum remains scarcely reported in the literature. To fill this gap, this study attempts to investigate how photovoice mediated self reflection could engage an EFL pre-service teacher in making a sense concerning her professional roles identity. Drawing on qualitative data gained from photovoice mediated reflection and multiple informal talks, this phenomenological case study reveals two major themes (1) teachers as manager: entertainer and (2) teacher as assessor: the development of teacher assessment identity. This study suggests that photovoice based self reflection allow a pre-service teacher to reconstruct her professional role identity without changing her perception as a teacher. By doing this, a pre-service teacher is more aware concerning her professional role identity so as to keep her professional development.

Keyword: Pre-service teacher, photovoice, reflection, teacher identity

Abstrak

Banyak penelitian telah mengkonfirmasi peran penting refleksi untuk mempromosikan identitas peran profesional calon guru dalam praktik

pengajaran mereka. Berbagai alat refleksi telah digunakan untuk mempromosikan identitas peran profesional calon guru bahasa Inggris sebagai bahasa asing (EFL) termasuk penulisan jurnal, penjurnalan melaui video, portofolio, diskusi kelompok, dan diskusi online. Namun, menggunakan photovoice sebagai alat refleksi untuk mempromosikan identitas peran profesional calon guru bahasa Inggris sebagai bahasa asing dalam praktik pengalaman lapangan masih jarang dilaporkan dalam literatur. Untuk mengisi kesenjangan ini, penelitian ini mencoba untuk menyelidiki bagaimana refleksi diri yang dimediasi oleh photovoice dapat melibatkan calon guru dalam memahami identitas peran profesionalnya. Berdasarkan data kualitatif yang diperoleh dari refleksi yang dimediasi oleh photovoice dan beberapa pembicaraan informal, studi kasus fenomenologi ini mengungkapkan dua tema utama (1) guru sebagai manajer: penghibur dan (2) guru sebagai penilai: pengembangan identitas penilaian guru. Penelitian ini menyarankan bahwa refleksi diri berbasis photovoice memungkinkan calon guru untuk mengkonstruksi atau merekonstruksi identitas peran profesionalnya tanpa mengubah persepsinya sebagai seorang guru. Dengan demikian seorang calon guru semakin sadar akan identitas peran profesionalnya sehingga dapat menjaga perkembangan keprofesionalannya.

Kata kunci: *calon guru, photovoice, refleksi, identitas guru*

Introduction

Sociocultural conditions and discourse surrounding teachers' practice are two major factors which construct teacher identity (Varghese, Morgan, Johnston, & Johnson, 2005). In second language teacher identity study, Miller (2009,) highlights that 'places identity and discourse at the heart of language teaching and learning' (p.172). Varghese et al. (2005,) have maintained that, 'in order to understand language teaching and learning we need to understand teachers: the professional, cultural, political, and individual identities which they claim or which are assigned to them' (p.22). Additionally, Farrel (2011) points out teachers (re)construct a conceptual meaning concerning their identity (their self-image) which is normally shown indirectly through their actions (their professional role identity) across their profession). To this end, teacher identity is

not static, multifaceted, and frequently irrational (Menard-Warwick, 2008, 2011; Morgan, 2004; Tsui, 2007; Varghese et al., 2005).

Teacher identity is fabricated as a result (product) of influences on the teacher as well as a process that is not permanent but a continuing dynamic interface in teacher development (Chong, S., Low, E.L., & Goh, K. C, 2011). Furthermore, the development of teacher identity is flowing due to complexness of numerous different contexts and connection (Olsen, 2008). Bucholtz & Hall (2005) and Korthagen (2004) in their study has confirmed that teachers' responses towards teacher education and their teaching practices are affected by their implicit beliefs and identities about students, subjects of teaching and role of teaching as well as responsibilities at different stages of their careers from pre-service teachers to qualified teachers.

Meanwhile, role identity reflects how teachers look into themselves through the worlds that they take part and the way they connect to others in and out of these worlds (Urrieta, 2007). Furthermore, Cohen (2008) addresses role identity as, 'powerful organizing structures because people get recognition, positive reinforcement from others, and other rewards when they accomplish roles successfully' (p. 82). Furthermore, Walkington (2005) points out that teacher role identity includes the entire of practical roles a teacher employs while acting upon his or her jobs, the feeling and believes about being a teacher and teaching, as well as the way these are formed by the changing philosophy of teachers about teaching. In the same vein, teacher role identity includes the way teachers get to know their roles inside their world and includes their beliefs, values, and perception regarding being a teacher and teaching (Farrel, 2011).

In initial teacher education (ITE) context, a teaching practicum is a starting stage to enter into the professional identity. Pennington and Richards (2016) point out that 'when novices enter the field of language teaching they become engaged in many different dimensions of learning, from those related to mastery of the subject matter of language teaching to those involved in

managing learning in the classroom, as well as issues involved in developing an understanding of themselves as teachers' (p.2). Making contact with others and with the surroundings is an interrelating phenomenon which shapes teachers' professional identity (Beijaard et al., 2004; Korthagen 2004; Sleegers and Kelchtermans 1999). Additionally, Chong, S., Long, E.L., & Goh, K.C, (2011) argue that the conceptions of teacher identity of student teachers are (re)constructed through the participants' excursive practices in the context of teacher training communities.

In considering pre-service teachers' professional roles identity development, reflective activities are highly recommended among scholars. Richards (1990) sees reflection as a critical aspect of teacher development. Korthagen (2004) argues that student teachers' professional identity development, their encouragement and eagerness for their occupation can be promoted through reflective practices. Furthermore, Beauchamp & Thomas (2009) view that it is valuable for people to investigate the existence of their teaching in teacher development so as to recognize their roles in their practice. Farrel (2011) subdivides reflection into three categories: reflection-on-action (reflection after an action), reflection-in-action (reflection during an action itself (spontaneous), and reflection-for-action (reflection as a result from on-action and in-action information for upcoming action).

Reflective practices mediated by a myriad of tools such as video, journals, diaries, blogs, group discussions, and online discussion have been widely documented in the literature to explore and develop teachers' professional identity. However, the use of photovoice as a tool for reflection to promote teachers' professional identity remains scarcely reported in the literature. Graziano (2011) reported that photovoice allow student teachers to take into account useful approaches of language teaching and learning by reflecting on their practices. Additionally, Widodo & Ferdiansyah (2018,) utilized photovoice to to record the way EFL pre-service teachers used photovoice to write reflective

diaries in their teaching practicum program by 'exercising their agency as classroom policy makers and curriculum actors, to build teacher autonomy, to explore different teaching practices, and to translate their pedagogical content knowledge into action' (p. 93).

By taking into account the fact that there is still little of investigation concerning the use of photovoice as a tool for self-reflection to enhance pre-service teachers' professional identity, the present phenomenological case study was undertaken to document how an EFL pre-service teacher used photovoice along with SHoWED analysis to enhance her tacher's identities during teaching practicum program. Since, identity is a complex educational phenomenon which results in multiple interpretations; the present study seeks to answer the question what professional identity did EFL pre-service teacher reflect on her photovoice during teaching practicum?

Research Methods

32 undergraduate students of English department in one of private university based in East Java participated in teaching practicum program. They were divided into 10 groups. Each group consists of 3 to 5 students with one supervisor from a faculty member that guide them during teaching practicum program. They did teaching practicum for two months in 10 senior high schools and vocational high schools based in East Java, Indonesia. In this respect, the researchers supervised 5 pre-service teachers. Meanwhile, the researchers only focused on one EFL pre-service teacher since we aim at producing an in-depth investigation of her professional identity during teaching practicum project. She was chosen for several considerations. First, she engaged actively in teaching practicum project. For example, she reflected her teaching experiences in every meeting. Second, she could be contacted easily and she gave a prompt response when researchers need to clarify or to explore more information regarding her

photovoice mediated reflection. Furthermore, her narrative photovoice is original and follow the procedure of photovoice methodology. Prior to teaching practicum acitivities, photovoice methodology was introduced by discussing techniques of photography and ethical aspects of photovoice. For training purposes, she was asked to take a picture and chose a picture she think most meaningful or important. Next, she reflected on the selected photos to promote deeper and more critical dialogues regarding her teaching practices. For this reason, she was guided using SHOWeD analysis (Wang, Yi, Tao, Carovano, 1998) which comprises five questions: What do you see here? What's really happening here? How does this relate to your lives? Why does this problem or this strength exist? What can we do about this?

To collect data in teacher identity, Golombek (1998) recommends that verbal-based data of language teachers concerning their experiences potentially offer a gateway into their professional identities. For this reason, the data of the present study were garnered from photovoice mediated reflection and informal talks. To analyze the data, interpretative phenomenological analysis was used to investigate how an EFL pre-service teacher (re)constructs her professional roles identity during her teaching practicum. In interpretative phenomenological analysis process, participants make a sense the meaning of their world and the researchers attempt to interpret that meaning to comprehend the participants' meaning making (Smith & Osborn, 2008). Then, the researchers change their position from emic (seeing the participants' experiences contextually) to etic (seeing data from outsiders' perspective to broaden theories and insights). To ease in analyzing the data, the photovoice-mediated reflections were coded based on explicit and implicit references to issues related to teacher role identity (Cohen, 2008).

Results and Discussion

Drawing on Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA), two emergent themes were identified: (1) teacher as manager: classroom entertainer and (2) teacher as assessor: the development of teacher assessment identity. These two themes show that photovoice based self reflection in teaching practicum context promote EFL pre-service teachers' identity and professional development. The themes were presented with data and analysis as well as discussion.

Finding 1 Teacher as manager: Classroom entertainer

Teacher as manager was the most frequent themes derived from pre-service teachers' photovoice-mediated self reflection and informal talks. Farrel (2011) address teacher as manager as a person trying to control any occasions in the classroom. In teaching practicum context, pre-service teachers at the beginning of their academic education usually fight against the complexness of the classroom and have constraints directing their attention to crucial elements or interactions in the classroom (Weber, 2018). In this regard, Richard (2001) highlights that pre-service teachers were challenged with the classroom complexities such as 'student behavior, movement, and interaction during a lesson'. (p.170). These complexities of classroom which require teacher to cope wich can be seen in the following data. In the beginning, Icha (pseudonym) played her role as manager in her first time of teaching. This can be seen in her following photovoice mediated reflection.

Figure 1. Icha was teaching in the first meeeting of her teaching practicum

It was my first meeting in teaching practicum. The class started in the afternoon in which **the classroom was hot** [ambient temperature]*.* Furthermore, most of **students felt more sleepy, lazy and not focused** [low engagement] to the classroom activity. Some chairs were empty because **some students were having a prayer** [order]. It is not effective situation to teach. There was only **one student who ignored** [disruptive behavior] the learning process It challenged me how to **handle and solve the problems** (teachers as maanger). In the starting stage, it is important to determine how learning will run I mean a pre service teacher must be able to identify what can be a potential problem and what they can do to prevent and handle the problem on the next step. When I read an article related to the problem I faced, it is important to make the classroom conducive and to control students' behavior because it can affect learning. It was one of teachers' competences. So, I focused to **solve the problems so that students can learn effectively** [careprovider]. (Photovoice, 6 February 2019)

Icha tried to understand and to cope with difficult situation in her first meeting of teaching practicum by reading articles concerning the problem she faced and she found that making the classroom conducive and to control students' behavior is one of teachers' competences. Icha then focused to solve the problems so that students can learn effectively. For this reason, O'Conner (2008) views caring as teachers' pedagogy or classroom management strategies. Icha played role as a manager for her class. She had to make a correct decision for the situation. In doing so, she focused to solve the problems. She wanted to

make students discipline and motivated to join the class. In this regard, Farrel (2011) subdivides teacher as manager as communication controller in that teachers attempt to control classroom communication and classroom interaction dynamics.

Figure 2 Icha was giving ice breaking in the second meeting of her teaching practicum

In the second meeting of her teaching practicum, Icha played role as a manager. Not wanting to look her students sleepy, lazy, and not focused, she entertained students before starting the learning activity by giving ice breaking. She found her students interested, energized and engaged the learning as well as the classroom atmosphere more cheerful and more energizing. Farrel (2011) refers Icha's role as teacher as a manager more specifically as an entertainer in that a teacher tells jokes, stories, games and other activities which promotes interesting and energetic activities. Farrel (2011) found in his study that the identity cluster findings (teachers as manager, teachers as acculturator, and teachers as professional) is the uniqueness of teaching English to speaker of other language (TESOL) professionals as teachers and is likely dissimilar characteristics for teachers of other disciplines. Furhtermmore, he notes that the role identity arise a question in the literature if it has been predetermined or individually constructed by teachers or not. Zurcher (1983) contends that

predetermined roles refers to position of structuralist as they stress the 'effect of historical factors, power distributions, and cultural values on role enactment', while individually constructed roles refers to position of symbolic interactionist which underlines' roles emerge from or are significantly shaped by interactions in specific social settings' (p.14). Cohen (2008) contends that the conception of role identity is "highlights the tension between received expectations and individual negotiation that is at the heart of teacher identity": 81).

> It was my second meeting with students in culinary class. I *gave ice breaking* [entertainer] before starting the learning activity. It could make students *more interested, energized and focused to engage* [engagement] in learning activity. I just tried to *make the classroom neat and more organized* [space management]. It was very effective to control students' behavior compared with previous meeting. I think that ice breaking is one of solutions to make the *classroom atmosphere more cheerful and more energizing* [space management]. This activity can make *students and pre service teacher being more engaged* [engagement]. Sometimes we need to enjoy some fun game to make our brain freshed and focused on the real situation again. When I read the literature, if students enjoy learning and learning will occur. So to make students not stressed is important in learning. (Photovoice, 13 February 2019)

Finding 2 Teacher as assessor: teacher assessment identity development

Teaching practicum gave students a space to promote their professional identity as assessor. Looney, et al (2017) frame the role of teachers as assessors into four classifications: (1) the teacher assessment identity dimension; (2) aspect of assessment; (3) purpose of assessment; and (4) external or classroom-based contexts of assessment. Icha administered writing test after she completed materials (descriptive text). She also informed that "the purpose of giving writing tests is to know the development of students' writing skills, and to find out the extent to which students are able to develop their writing skills, especially in descriptive text" (informal talk, 15 February 2019). In this regard, Icha administered formative test to know the development of her students writing progress after they joined the learning process. In the same vein,

phtovoice mediated self reflection confirmed the purpose of the test. Furthermore, Icha used the test for learning. From test, she could gain information what she needs to do to achieve the goals or targeted score whether or not she changed the teaching method or learning media.

Meanwhile, teachers' knowledge, skills, beliefs, and *confidence* in their assessment knowledge, skills and practices, as well as their all natural tendencies to assessment, involving the way they take part in assessment or scrutiny their assessment job or function are connecting with dimension of teacher identity assessment (Looney, et al, 2017). Informed by photovoice mediated self reflection, Icha believed that test can measure students' knowledge and whether teacher achieved the learning goal or not. For this reason, Icha made sure that the test had to be done seriously, fairly, and well-constructed. Icha also reported that "the assessment model carried out referring to the descriptive components. It also refers to analytic scoring by Brown where descriptive text will be scored based on content 30%, organization 20%, grammar 20%, vocabulary 15%, and mechanic 15%. The descriptive writing test that is given is not giving questions such as in multiple choice test, but rather gives students the test of making a descriptive text based on the images they choose surrounding them." (Informal talk, 9 March 2020) This informed that Icha has enough knowledge and skill how to conduct assessment or test. She used analytic scoring for the writing test in that each of criteria has different score and instructed students to write based on the picture chosen. She used a picture to scaffold students to conduct the test.

Figure 3: Icha was administering a writing test

This picture was captured when I conducted ***a post test after completing one topic*** [purpose of assessment] of learning material. I observed the activity from the front of classroom. I control the test to determine ***whether the test is done fairly or unfairly*** [teacher assessment identity]*.* A test is very important to ***measure the students' knowledge*** [teacher assessment identity], and can ***measure how far the teacher achieved the learning goals*** [aspect of assessment]. The students' score of the test can be an indicator ***whether learning is successful or failed*** [aspect of assessment], the real problem faced by students, and can be ***a valuable information what teacher should do*** [aspect of assessment] to increase the score or to achieve goals. Because the students' ***writing test is an instrument to know students' writing performance*** [aspect of assessment], it related to taught materials. I thought that teaching is not just about transfering materials, but we must ***give assessment or test to reflect our teaching activity*** [teacher assessment identity] ***as well as prepare what we should do after the test*** [aspect of assessment]. Changing our method or the learning media will be based on the goals or scores. Giving test to students can help me ***make a more exact decision to give the next treatment*** [aspect of assessment] to the class*.* (Photovoice, 6 Maret 2019).

Conclusion

The use of photovoice-based self reflection allows students to recognize her professional identity through teaching practices in teaching practicum context. Recognizing the role identities does not mean changing their identity as a teacher. Farrel (2011) contends that the aim was to assist teachers to become more conscious of their role identity and later on determine whether they are likely to make changes to their roles and in what ways they make the changes. Thus, helping pre-service teachers to become more aware regarding their roles can promote professional development. By knowing pre-service teacher roles as a manager: a classroom entertainer, and teacher as assessor: the development of teacher identity assessment, she was aware that teaching is not only transferring knowledge but how knowledge is perceived by students in a condusive classroom atmosphere as well as how knowledge or competence is assessed in a proper fashion as well use the outcome of the assessment for teaching and learning purposes. Although phtovoice-based self reflection shows significant impacts to promote EFL pre-service teachers' professional identity development, future studies calls for more phenomenological case studies to explore pre-service teachers' professional role identities through photovoice-based self reflection so as EFL pre-service teachers are more aware about the complexity of their professional roles identity within and beyond the classroom.

References

Beauchamp C, Thomas L (2009) Understanding Teacher Identity: An Overview of Issues in the Literature and Implications for Teacher Education. *Cambridge Journal of Education 39*(2), p.175–189.

Beijaard, D., Meijer, P. C., & Verloop, N. (2004). Reconsidering Research on Teachers' Professional Identity. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, *20*, p.107-128.

Bucholtz, M., & Hall, K. (2005). Identity and Interaction: A Socio-Cultural Linguistic Approach. *Discourse Studies,* 74, p.585—614.

Chong, S. & Low, E. L., & Goh, K.C. (2011). Emerging Professional Identity of Pre-Service Teachers. *Australian journal of teacher education, 36*(8), p.50-64.

Cohen, J., (2008). That's Not Treating You as A Professional': Teachers Constructing Complex Professional Identities through Talk. *Teachers and Teaching. 14 (2*), p.79-93.

Farrell TC (2009) Exploring the Professional Role Identities of Experienced ESL Teachers through Reflective Practice. *System*, 39, p.54-62.

Golombek, P., Jordan, S.R., (2005). Becoming 'Lack Lambs' Not 'Parrots': A Poststructuralist Orientation to Intelligibility and Identity. *TESOL Quarterly* 39 (3), p.513-533.

Golombek, P., (1998). A study of language teachers' personal practical knowledge. *TESOL Quarterly* 32, p.447-464.

Graziano, K. J. (2011). Working with English language learners: Preservice teachers and photovoice. *International Journal of Multicultural Education, 13*(1), p.1-19

Korthagen, F. (2004). In search of the essence of a good teacher: towards a more holistic approach in teacher education. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, *20*, p.77-97.

Looney, A., Cumming, J., Kleij. F.V. D., & Harris, K. (2017). Reconceptualising the role of teachers as assessors: teacher assessment identity. *Assessment in Education: Principles, Policy & Practice. p. 1-26*

Miller, J., (2009). In: Burns, A., Ann, Richards, J.C. (Eds.), *The Cambridge Guide to Second Language Teacher Education.* Cambridge University Press, New York, pp. 172-181

Menard-Warwick, J. (2008). The cultural and intercultural identities of transnational English teachers: Two case studies from the Americas. *TESOL Quarterly*, 42, p. 617–640.

Menard-Warwick, J. (2011). Chilean English Teacher Identity and Popular Culture: Three Generations. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 14, p.261–277.

Olsen, B. (2008). *Teaching What They Learn, Learning What They Live.* Boulder, CO: Paradigm Publishers.

O'Conner, K. E. (2008). "You Choose to Care": Teachers, Emotions and Professional Identity. *Teaching and teacher education*. 24, p.117-126.

Park, J., (2007). Co-Construction of Nonnative Speaker Identity in Cross-Cultural Interaction. *Applied Linguistics*, 28 (3), 339e360.

Pennington MC, Richards JC (1997) Tacher Identity in Language Teaching: Integrating Personal, Contextual, And Professional Factors. *RELC journal,* p. 1-9

Richards, J. C. (1990) *Second Language Teacher Education*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Richards, J. C. (2001) Beyond Methods. In C. N. Candlin and N. Mercer (eds).

Sleegers, P. and G. Kelchtermans. (1999). Inleiding op het themanummer: Professionele identiteit van leraren [Introduction to the theme issue: Teachers' professional identity. *Pedagogisch Tijdschrift,* 24: 369-373

Smith, J.A., & Osborn, M. (2008). Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis. *In J.A Smith (Ed) Qualitative Psychology: A practical guide to research methods*. London: Sage.

Tsui, A. M. (2007). Complexities of identity formation: A narrative inquiry of an EFL teacher. TESOL Quarterly, 41, p.657–680.

Urrieta, L., (2007). Figured worlds and education: an introduction to the special issue. *The Urban Review 39* (2), 107-116.

Varghese, M., Morgan, B., Johnston, B., Johnson, K., (2005). Theorizing Language Teacher Identity: Three Perspectives and Beyond. *Journal of Language Identity and Education*, 4 (1), 21e44.

Widodo, P. W., & Ferdiansyah, S. (2018). Engaging Student Teachers in Video-Mediated Self-Reflection in Teaching Practica in *Routledge International Handbook of Schools and Schooling in Asia.* Routledge*.*

Wang, C., Yi, W.K., Tao, Z.W., & Carovano, K. (1998). Photovoice as A Participatory Health Promotion Strategy. *Health Promotion International, 13*(1), 75-86.

Walkington, J., (2005). Becoming a teacher; encouraging development of teacher identity through reflective practice. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Teacher Education 33* (1), 53-64.

Weber, K.L., Gold, B., Prilop, C. N., & Kleinknecht, M. (2018). Promoting pre-service teachers' professional vision of classroom management during practical school training: Effects of a structured online- and video-based self-reflection and feedback intervention. *Teaching and teacher education*. 76, p.39-49.

Zurcher, L.A., (1983). *Social Roles: Conformity, Conflict, and Creativity*. Sage, Beverly Hills, CA.